

‘*Más Meninas*’: Through the Looking Glass, Repeatedly

Gertje R. Utley

Picasso's spectacular series of variations after Velázquez's *Las Meninas* set the stage for a dramatic rediscovery and revaluation of the seventeenth-century master's work, ending close to half a century of almost total neglect by the artistic community.¹

The paintings can be seen as part of (and even as pioneering) an artistic climate in which the return to realism and figuration inspired a vast revival of citations of previous artworks. The resulting works ranged in variety from the faithful copy—now valued as ‘appropriation art’—to the vaguest allusion to underlying artistic, theoretical, philosophical, and/or political themes in the original.

Some of the scores of artists who found inspiration in Velázquez's famous canvas after the middle of the twentieth century (of whom only a selected few could be addressed in this essay), may indeed have been inspired by Picasso's series. Mostly, however, other deeper intellectual and sociopolitical considerations inspired this unprecedented flowering of artistic citations of *Las Meninas* and fostered a wide variety in the works' form and media. Beyond its position as monument to the art of painting itself, *Las Meninas* fascinates younger generations of artists because of its mysteries of perception and reflection; its intriguing dynamic relationship between the artist, the artwork, and its audience; and its self-referencing inclusion of the process of its creation on the canvas.

Some artists seem primarily to have concentrated on the extravagance of the regal costumes, as Franz von Stuck did in his self-portrait with wife and daughter (see p. 69); while others referred to the painting in terms of a critical confrontation with the art and the values of the past. Increasingly, however, references to *Las Meninas*, as to other artworks, would serve as a vehicle for expressing issues that transcended purely aesthetic considerations, as a template for the modern artist's inquiry into areas of philosophical, social, or political concern, and as a tool for articulating a critique of contemporary sociopolitical or artistic conventions.² For others it served as a testing ground for the application of theoretical concepts of perception, presentation, and consumption of the artwork.

Increasingly artists strove to establish both a distance from and a polemical dialogue with Velázquez's original through the process of interpretation. Moreover, irony at times became a

powerful tool for the citation, especially when its aim was to question and debunk the sanctity of the work of art itself. It should not be surprising that many of the artists who engaged in the dialogue with *Las Meninas* are of Spanish or South American origin. For them, Velázquez represented above all the legacy of their cultural identity.

Among the first artists to follow Picasso's *Las Meninas* series with his own variations in 1958, only one year after Picasso's homage, was his contemporary and fellow Spaniard Salvador Dalí. Forever in competition with Picasso, Dalí took up the challenge with his canvas *Velázquez Painting the Infanta Margarita with the Lights and Shadows of His Own Glory* (see p. 73), in which he combines citations of *Las Meninas* and of Velázquez's portrait of the Infanta Margarita of Austria. Dalí had admired Picasso's ingenuity, in the first of his variations, in endowing the figure of Velázquez with superhuman stature.³ Yet in his own painting he reduces Velázquez to a tiny figure, almost lost in the vast, light-filled space, and monumentally overshadowed by the ethereal apparition of his own creation, the image of the infanta.

Dalí's use of sparkling, diamond-like bursts of color in this painting is a direct homage to Velázquez's technique. The combination of pointillist dots and loose calligraphic lines, however, reveals Dalí's admiration for Art Informel in the work of Yves Klein, Georges Mathieu, and Antoni Tàpies; and it draws from his pseudoscientific ideas about what he called ‘nuclear mysticism’, an idiosyncratic concoction of his rather vague ideas of quantum theory, metaphysics, and religion.⁴ Dalí's admiration for Velázquez, which is reflected in innumerable variations on *Las Meninas* and perhaps more obviously in Dalí's flamboyant mustachio, took on increasingly nationalistic overtones in line with his enthusiastic support of Franco. Writing in 1960, which was also the year of the major Velázquez exhibition at the Prado, he praised Velázquez as ‘*imperialista, realista i eucuménico*’[sic], declaring—in an unmistakable jab at Picasso—all expressionistic deformation to be anti-Spanish.⁵

With the development of New Realism in painting in the later 1960s, the number of variations on earlier art increased considerably, and the trend to cite or even reproduce artworks became an integral part of artistic practice. Instrumental in this was the rebellion, by Pop artists in particular, against the Abstract Expressionists' dogmatic propagation of the modernist myth of

originality and individuality. Perceived as a consumer product, the work of art's sanctity was being demystified through irony, humor, and parody. In addition, its appropriation could serve as critical commentary on the contemporary art scene, as well as on sociopolitical conditions.⁶

The English artist Richard Hamilton (b. 1922), one of the first European artists to use aspects of Pop Art in his oeuvre, was less interested, however, in totally subverting the high art status of the appropriated image, aiming rather to stimulate the viewer's response to the earlier representation, and to adapt it to contemporary experience.⁷ His etching *Picasso's Meninas* of 1973 (see p. 183) honors the two artists he most admired: Velázquez and Picasso. While Hamilton stayed faithful to the composition of Velázquez's painting, he replaced the cast of characters with figures appropriated from the various stylistic periods of Picasso's oeuvre. Behind the canvas Picasso himself fills the position of his seventeenth-century predecessor, wearing (as an added comment on his politics) the communist symbol of hammer and sickle instead of the decoration worn by the court painter Velázquez. In order to do justice to the qualities he most valued in Picasso's art—his stylistic variety and the 'masterly craftsmanship and love of the medium that Picasso demonstrated in his own etchings'—Hamilton secured the collaboration of Picasso's master printer Aldo Crommelynck.⁸

Velázquez's example, and in particular his *Las Meninas*, remained central to Hamilton's concern with issues of vision, perspective, and the role of the viewer, and can be recognized in several of his works, as in the play of ambiguities in *Interior I* and *Interior II* (fig. 1) of 1964, in which collaged elements, a real pencil and mirror, are self-referential to the work's production.⁹ This emphasis on the tools and mechanism of the creation of the image became an integral part of the structuralism of the 1960s; it also appears in the work of Giulio Paolini and Jeff Wall, among others, as we will see below.¹⁰

Strongly influenced by Richard Hamilton, the two artists Manolo Valdés (b. 1942) and Rafael Solbes (1939-1981), who collaborated under the name Equip Crònica, were among the first Spanish artists of their generation to show an interest in Pop. Like that of other Pop artists, their art relies heavily on the combination of sources from both high and low culture, including mass media and advertising.¹¹ Natives of Valencia, the two artists belonged in the early 1960s to the local branch

of Estampa Popular, a radical underground movement of young graphic artists whose strong political, pro-democratic agenda protested against the conditions of cultural and political repression under Franco.¹² This position inspired paintings such as *El recinte* (see p. 185) in their series *Policía y cultura*, in which the individuals in Velázquez's canvas have been replaced by modern works of art by Saura, Miró, Dalí, and Picasso. In several of their variations on *Las Meninas* the artists appropriated images from Picasso's series, thereby complicating the political commentary through the polemic between the court painter of Philip IV and the avowedly Communist Picasso. Most of their works are biting parodies, condemning conditions in Franco's Spain and commenting on the way Velázquez had been appropriated by Franco's fascist government for propagandistic aims.

1960 was the tercentennial of Velázquez's death, marked by many commemorations in Spain, including a major exhibition of his work at the Prado. The government-sponsored events were seen by artists who opposed the regime as the confiscation of Velázquez's image. This triggered new trends in the artistic appropriation of his oeuvre, which both in the visual arts and in literature became increasingly tinged with political protest.¹³

After Solbes's death, Manolo Valdés continued his repeated references to *Las Meninas* in his paintings as well as in his sculptural work (see p. 176-177) — now, however, less for its polemic content than as a starting point for his own artistic exploration. His works now indulge in a more sensuous approach, employing a very tactile and painterly style, that frequently includes collage elements of burlap, and appearing much closer to the Informalismo he previously criticized in his art.¹⁴

The sense of social responsibility that motivated many of the variations on *Las Meninas* was understandably of particular relevance in the work of Spanish and South American artists, who through the transfer of the original's surmised allegorical intent onto contemporary conditions would use citations of Velázquez's painting as a tool to address the present.¹⁵

Antonio Saura (1930-1998), the cofounder of the Spanish Informel movement El Paso (Madrid, 1955) —the first postwar movement in Spain to belong to the international avant-garde— always acknowledged a strong political component in much of his work. His *Infantas* (see p. 179 and fig. 2), which not coincidentally he started to create in 1960, the year of the great Velázquez exhibition in Madrid, belong to what he calls his 'denunciation paintings'.

They were—like much of his oeuvre of those years— motivated by his protest against the sociopolitical climate under Franco's dictatorship. They also belong to the artist's intense but ambivalent engagement with the national artistic legacy.¹⁶ Like Picasso, Saura compared his canvases to battlefields, and like Goya, he almost always combined the tragic with the absurd, adding a strong element of parody.¹⁷ Like his portraits, Saura's *Infantas* of 1960 and his *Menina de muerte* of 1973 are what he called approximations, only a step removed from abstraction. Highly gestural, almost violent in their execution, they are based on images that serve as starting points, as pretexts for the action on the canvas, where the artist pursues what Dore Ashton called Saura's passion to eviscerate reality.¹⁸

While the art of the Mexican Alberto Gironella (1929-1999) is not quite as overtly political as the work of Equip Crònica, his dark visions address issues of colonialism, national identity and Mexico's past under Spanish rule. Gironella's first work to relate to *Las Meninas*, *Festín en palacio* [*Banquet in the Palace*] of 1958 (fig. 3), is an assemblage of painted, sculpted, and readymade elements. Strongly influenced by the artist's admiration for Surrealism and the Baroque, and clearly rooted in the reliquaries, tabernacles, and altars of Gironella's Catholic upbringing, the work is an ironic comment on the powers of church and state and on the decadence at the court of Philip IV.¹⁹ In 1968, and again in 1975, Gironella revisits *Las Meninas* in a series with the title *Cámara obscura* (see p. 188), in which he provides Velázquez with a camera, alluding to the Baroque painting's mysteries of perspective, vision, and focus — aspects that were to inspire a great number of artists, as we will see below.²⁰

The Basque sculptor Jorge Oteiza Embil (1908-2003) always conceived of his art as socially relevant. He saw it as a tool in his quest for a Basque national identity, and for the achievement of harmony between man and the universe, between spiritual and material values. This harmony, he felt, was supremely achieved in Velázquez's work. Oteiza's cube-like, abstract sculptures, *Homenaje a Las Meninas* of 1958 (see p. 197) and their reworking in 1974, stem from the artist's belief that they represented the basic abstract form most likely to achieve a similar balance. The cutaway corners create voids, an emptying out of space and expression belonging to what Oteiza called the concave or silent strain in art. Devoted to conveying spiritual qualities, that strain was extremely rare and could, according to the artist, be found almost exclusively in Basque art. It would become the sole focus of his own creation.²¹

This absence and silence also infuses the Spanish artist Soledad Sevilla's elusive paintings after *Las Meninas* (1981-1983) (see p. 199). There is little in her ethereal and lyrical abstract work that calls forth the Baroque original, except the feeling of space. Sevilla's paintings and installations are about nostalgia and the perception of transience.²²

With the rise of conceptual art in the 1960s and 1970s *Las Meninas* attracted a growing number of artists because of what was then seen as Velázquez's approach to the mechanics of perception and of artistic production. Seminal in this new understanding and appreciation of Velázquez's *Las Meninas* were newly popular Neoplatonic ideas, as well as the French philosopher Michel Foucault's article on *Las Meninas*, the opening chapter in *Les mots et les choses* (in English, *The Order of Things*). There Foucault defines Velázquez's painting as 'representation of representation' and investigates the painting's complexities of representation, its ambiguities of perspective, and the role and position of the viewer versus that of the artist.²³

Foucault's influence lies behind the groundbreaking video work of the Chilean-born multimedia artist Juan Downey (1940-1993), as does the artist's firm belief in the transformative powers of technology in the artistic, as well as the socioeconomic sphere.²⁴ Downey's video *Las Meninas* of 1975, may have been inspired by his memory of the almost orgasmic reaction he experienced when he first saw Velázquez's painting at the Prado as a twenty-two-year-old. It is a lyrical evocation of the painting, in which actors impersonating Philip IV and his queen appear with dancers whose abstracted movements engage in a dialogue with mirror images. The video and its action serve as a scrim for the artist on which to project his meditations on reflection, representation, and perception, as well as on sociopolitical issues. Lacing his words with quotations from Michel Foucault and George Kubler, Downey delivers a sharp critique of colonialism and of artistic, economic, and political conditions in seventeenth-century Spain, and, by implication, in his own time.

The French artist Philippe Comar (b. 1955), a theoretician of perspective and a professor of aesthetics at the École des Beaux-Arts in Paris, was equally impelled by Foucault's ideas. He too was intrigued by the spatial and perspectival ambiguities in Velázquez's *Las Meninas* and by the painting's distinctive dynamic between author and viewer. His homage to *Las Meninas* (1978) (see p. 201 and fig. 4) is a three-dimensional wooden installation

that replicates the spatial perspective of the painting.²⁵ Comar constructed the space in the form of an optical pyramid whose apex occupies the vanishing point and whose base represents the surface of the canvas. The view through a peephole restores the exact spatial perspective of the painting. More precisely, it reveals two divergent perspectives: one where we are situated facing the door, and the image we see in the mirror is the image of the king and queen as reflected from the canvas; and the other where we are facing the mirror, thus occupying the place of the subject of the painting.

Foucault's emphasis on the role of the viewer to the detriment of the position of the author became instrumental for the work of the Italian artist Giulio Paolini (b. 1940)²⁶ One of the earliest practitioners of Minimal Art, Arte Povera, and Conceptual Art, and fascinated primarily by the dialectic of the gaze since the early 1960s, Paolini has practically abandoned easel painting in favor of the idea of art as linguistic play.²⁷ He replaced the act of painting with the engagement with the tools and mechanics of art-making themselves, presenting canvas and easel for their own sake, and concentrating on perspective, space, and light. The model of *Las Meninas* was essential to this development. Its impact can easily be seen in such works as Paolini's series of lithographs, *Contemplator Enim* of 1991 (see p. 195 and fig. 5), in the perspective through an open door, and the complex use of mirror images of the artist at work. It is also visible in his *Fuori l'autore*, a lithograph in which the back of a canvas projects into the foreground space.²⁸

In the work of several artists it is this focus on the mechanism and ambivalence of perception, and on the process of the artwork's production within the image of the artwork that now appears as the sole link to Velázquez's painting. This is what remains of Velázquez's influence in works such as the photograph *Picture for Women*, 1979 (fig. 6) by the Canadian artist Jeff Wall (b. 1946), where it is reduced to the ambiguous play with mirror imagery and the inclusion of the artist as an integral part of the artwork itself.

The fascination with theoretical rather than pictorial (or sociopolitical) issues became increasingly prevalent in appropriation art during the 1990s. Increasingly it was the distance from the physical similarity to the model that would define the resulting artwork, as artists aimed to invigorate the dialogue between the citation and the original.

In Michael Craig-Martin's *Las Meninas III*, (see p. 207) only the large sunglasses and the shaving mirror give a clue to his painting's

dependence on *Las Meninas*. They refer not only to the ambiguities of perception and reflection in Velázquez's original, but also to Foucault's insistence on the centrality of the role of the viewer in the interpretation of a work of art.²⁹ Painted in the artist's typically flat and glowing colors, it shows its author's interest in Pop, minimal, and conceptual art.

Some of the most important postmodernist investigations of representation belong to photography. Photographers were particularly inspired by Foucault's perception that the optical diagram that structures the perspective in *Las Meninas* anticipates by centuries the system of vision that photography is based on.³⁰

The American photographer Joel-Peter Witkin (b. 1939) added Foucault to the list of those to whom he dedicated *Las Meninas. New Mexico*, in 1987 (see p. 191); a list that included Velázquez, Picasso, Miró, and Spain, as he noted on a preparatory drawing for this work. Created at the suggestion of the Spanish Ministry of Culture, the work includes many of Witkin's usual themes and figures: the artist's self-portrait in the place of Velázquez, the figure of Christ in the place of Nieto, in the open doorway, and the maimed and disabled. They form his usual cast of characters, for which he finds the players in a morgue in Mexico.³¹

With his morbid visions, Witkin aims to emulate the darkness in the works of Goya and Blake, in response to 'our violent age', and he seems to concur with Thomas Mann, who said that modern art 'sees life as tragicomic, with the result that the grotesque is its most genuine style'.³² Witkin sees his works as having a sacred mission. He calls them *memento mori*, and claims they are his way of praying.³³

The Brazilian-born photographic artist Vik Muniz (b. 1961) has been working since the early 1990s re-creating images from the media and from art history in the most unusual materials, such as dust or thread—or even, as in the case of *Las Meninas*, chocolate (see p. 192)—and then photographing the result. Less interested in photography as such than in the semiology of the image, he is fascinated by the process of making things visible and by the ambiguity of identity and perception.³⁴ Although humor plays a role in his choice of medium, the primary role of the unusual materials is to act as a distancing factor, in order to slow perception and thereby challenge us to focus our attention more carefully.³⁵

Distancing is also an important aspect of the work of the Japanese artist Yasumasa Morimura (b. 1951), who aims to subvert the boundaries between painting, photography, and performance, between male and female, by enacting famous female figures

from the world of cinema or art history and turning them into photographic self-portraits. In his series *Daughter of Art History* he appears twice as the Infanta Margarita (see p. 175).

One of the major artistic occupations of the German artist Thomas Struth (b. 1954) has been photographing the work of art in public places, churches, museums, and temples where it interacts with its public, frequently far removed from the site for which it was intended.³⁶ His large photos create powerful comments about the presentation and consumption of art in public spaces and are in tune with the questioning of and investigations into museums' exhibition practices during the 1980s and 90s.³⁷

Fascinated by the act of seeing, Struth created what may be his most relevant series on that subject: the photographs of *Las Meninas* (see p. ???) that he took at the Prado in 2005. We see Velázquez's cast of characters staring out in rapt attention at groups of respectful tourists and unruly schoolchildren. The series of photographs is the central part of a project the artist engaged in with the Prado in the spring of 2006, in which his own works were shown in a special installation among masterworks from the museum's collection (fig. 7).

However, not every artist has approached *Las Meninas* with an eye to political or theoretical investigation. The painter Fermín Aguayo (1926-1977) admits that, despite his enduring passion for Velázquez, he tackles his predecessor's painting as a model for his realistic copies just as he would an apple in a still-life.³⁸ And the French painter Louis Cane's (b. 1943) repeated citations of *Las Meninas* (see p. 193) arise from his admiration for Velázquez's use of color and space.³⁹ In his extremely free variations, as in much of his art, Cane concentrates on the suggestive—he would say 'erotic'—power of color, endowing his paintings with what he calls 'sexualité chromatisée'.⁴⁰

The video artist Eve Sussman (b. 1961) also focuses on the painterly qualities of *Las Meninas*, as well as on its aura of mystery and ambiguity. She was struck by the almost photographic qualities of Velázquez's painting and how it occupies the space between art and reality. Her twelve-minute (high definition digital) video, *89 Seconds at Alcázar*, is built around her perception of *Las Meninas* as functioning like a film still. In using actors to portray the various characters of Velázquez's painting, her video imagines the moments just before and after the depicted scene in the Alcázar palace (see p. 212-213).⁴¹ Through focus on the human

exchange between the various individuals, the artist achieves the emotional and psychological content of feature films. Fascinated by simple gestures and seemingly casual expression, she combines observed with choreographed movement.⁴² The London-born artist now lives and works in Brooklyn and operates as part of a loose team made up of the 35 members of her Rufus Corporation. Together they also produced a 21-minute film, *Inside 89 Seconds at Alcázar*, documenting the creation of her video, which was shot in a garage in Brooklyn.

Antonio de Felipe (b. 1965), a young Spanish member of the group Cracking Art, belongs to a new generation of Pop artists. Lacking the tinge of nostalgia that can be found in the work of their predecessors, artists like Antonio de Felipe lighten their paintings with a strong element of humor. Children of the information age, they share Pop's infatuation with imagery derived from the mass media, and look to advertising and the glamour of Hollywood to update their citations from art history. In his *In-Fanta de limón* of 1992 (see p. 181), one of his portraits of the Infanta in his *Homenaje a Velázquez* series, he plays with the phonetic similarity with Fanta, a soft drink popular in Spain, and replaces the ribbons in the hair of Velázquez's *Infanta María Teresa of Spain* with slices of lemon.

While for some artists Velázquez's *Las Meninas* has served no greater purpose than apples did for Cézanne, others have looked to the painting as a model of artistic excellence, as a national cultural icon, as a template imbued with culturally accessible referents for political comment, or for philosophical reflections on creation and perception. All seem to prove what Walter Benjamin had predicted in his influential essay, 'The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction': while 'the presence of the original is the prerequisite to the concept of authenticity', reproductions can acquire new meaning within a new temporal and geographic context. As *Las Meninas* has continued to captivate the interest of artists throughout the latter part of the twentieth century, and during the beginning of the twenty-first, there is every reason to believe that new generations of artists will continue to follow Picasso's example. He showed us once again that in looking back three centuries at the art of his illustrious predecessor, he was far from pursuing a reactionary path. He was in reality, and not for the first time, a long way ahead of trends that would only come to full fruition in the work of later generations of artists.

- 1 This text is based on my essay 'Las Meninas in Twentieth Century Art', in Suzanne L. Stratton-Pruitt (ed.), *Velázquez's Las Meninas*. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2003, p. 170-202. For the history of artistic variations after *Las Meninas* see also Mary Anne Goley, *The Influence of Velázquez on Modern Painting: The American Experience* [exh. cat.]. Washington, Federal Reserve Board, 2000, and Caroline Kesser, *Las Meninas von Velázquez. Eine Wirkungs und Rezeptionsgeschichte*. Berlin, Reimer, 1994. I am greatly indebted to Dr. Stratton-Pruitt for having drawn my attention to this topic, and I thank Lynn Zelevansky, Roxana Marcoci, Christopher Bedford, Barbara London, and Anne Umland for their helpful input.
- 2 Benjamin Buchloh, 'Allegorical Procedures: Appropriation and Montage in Contemporary Art', *Artforum* 21, no. 1, September 1982, p. 53. Benjamin Buchloh, 'Parody and Appropriation in Francis Picabia, Pop and Sigmar Polke', *Artforum* 20, no. 7, March 1982, p. 28.
- 3 Salvador Dalí, 'Ecumenical "chafarrinada" of Velázquez', *Art News* 59, no. 10, February 1961, p. 55.
- 4 Robert Lubar, *Dalí: The Salvador Dalí Museum Collection*. Boston, Bulfinch Press, 2000, p. 145.
- 5 Salvador Dalí, 'O figura', in *Homenaje informal a Velázquez* [exh. cat.]. Barcelona, Sala Gaspar, 1960.
- 6 Viola Vahrson, *Die Radikalität der Wiederholung: Interferenzen und Paradoxien im Werk Sturtevant's*. Munich, Wilhelm Fink, 2006, p. 39.
- 7 Richard Morphet, 'Richard Hamilton: the longer view', in *Richard Hamilton* [exh. cat.]. London, National Gallery, 1992, p. 14. B. Buchloh, 'Allegorical Procedures...', *op. cit.*, p. 46. See also B. Buchloh, 'Parody and...', *op. cit.*, p. 28.
- 8 C. Kesser, *Las Meninas...*, *op. cit.*, p. 188.
- 9 Richard Morphet with intro. Robert Rosenblum, *Encounters: New Art from Old* [exh. cat.]. London, National Gallery, 2000, p. 149.
- 10 Craig Owens, 'Representation, Appropriation and Power', *Art in America*, 70, no. 5, May 1982, p. 9-11, 21. David Company, "A Theoretical Diagram in an Empty Classroom": Jeff Wall's Picture for Women', *Oxford Art Journal*, no. 30, March 2007, p. 18.
- 11 Manolo Valdés with an introduction by Tomàs Llorens, *Manolo Valdés: The timelessness of art*. Bogotá, Villegas Editores, 1999, p. 11; Dan Cameron, 'Contents under pressure: Equipo Crónica', *Artforum* 89, November 1989, p. 126.
- 12 D. Cameron, 'Contents under...', *op. cit.*, p. 126. Carla Stellweg, 'New Mirrors for a New Society: Seven artists in post-Franco Spain', *Art News* 79, no. 3, March 1980, p. 63.
- 13 See C. Kesser, *Las Meninas...*, *op. cit.*, p. 177-179 on the highly influential play by Antonio Buero Vallejo, *Las Meninas: a fantasía in two parts* (transl. Marion Peter Holt). San Antonio, Texas, 1987.
- 14 Valeriano Bozal, 'Manolo Valdés, ways of looking at worlds', in *Manolo Valdés* [exh. cat.]. São Paulo, Pinacoteca do Estado, 1998, p. 173. See also Josep Palau i Fabre, *Dancing notes on Las Meninas* (with monotypes by Manolo Valdés). Paris, 2000. D. Cameron, 'Contents under...', *op. cit.*, p. 128.
- 15 Gerhard Ahrens in Gerhard Ahrens and Katrin Sello, *Nachbilder: Vom Nutzen und Nachteil des Zitierens für die Kunst* [exh. cat.]. Hannover, Kunstverein Hannover, 1979, p. 58.
- 16 Paule Gauthier, 'Saura', *Cimaise* 24, no. 131-132, July-October 1977, p. 38. Severo Sarduy, 'Galerías (portraits imaginaires)' in Gérard de Cortanze, *Antonio Saura*. Paris, La Différence, 1994, p. 221-228.
- 17 Waldemar Georges, 'Saura et la Naissance de la Tragédie', in *Antonio Saura: retratos imaginarios* [exh. cat.]. Madrid, Galería Juana Mordó, 1972, p. 11 (written in 1959 but previously unpublished).
- 18 Antonio Saura, 'Iniciales', in Rainer Michel Mason, *Antonio Saura: pinturas 1956-1985* [exh. cat.]. Madrid, Ministerio de Cultura, 1989, p. 15; Dore Ashton, *Antonio Saura* [exh. cat.]. Paris, Galerie Lelong, 1997, n. p.
- 19 Margarita María de Guadalupe Martínez Lámbarry, *Tradición y ruptura en la pintura de Alberto Gironella* [exh. cat.]. Mexico City, Centro de Arte Mexicano, 1988, n. p.; Alberto Gironella, *Esto es galla; Alberto Gironella, exposición antológica* [exh. cat.]. México City, Museo Rufino Tamayo, 1984, p. 76. Valerie Fraser, 'Surrealising the Baroque: Mexico's Spanish Heritage and the work of Alberto Gironella', *Oxford Art Journal* 14, no. 1, 1991, p. 34-43. C. Kesser, *Las Meninas...*, *op. cit.*, p. 180.
- 20 Salvador Elizondo, 'Camera Obscura', in *Antonio Gironella Camera Obscura* [exh. cat.]. Mexico City, Galería Juan Martín, 1968.
- 21 Margit Rowell, 'A sense of place / a sense of space: the sculpture of Jorge Oteiza', and Amador Vega, 'Mysticism and aesthetics in the thought of Jorge Oteiza', in Margit Rowell (et al.), *Oteiza: mito y modernidad*. Bilbao, Guggenheim Museum, 2004, p. 344, 355.
- 22 Soledad Lorenzo, *Soledad Sevilla* [exh. cat.]. Madrid, Galería de Arte Soledad Lorenzo, 1989, n. p.
- 23 Michel Foucault, *Les Mots et les Choses: Archéologie des sciences humaines*. Paris, Gallimard, 1966; *The Order of Things: An Archeology of Human Sciences*. London, Random House, 1970.
- 24 Gabriela Rangel, *Juan Downey: Drawings from Las Meninas and the Looking Glass*. New York, Nohra Haime Gallery, in association with the Juan Downey Foundation, 2005, n. p.
- 25 Philippe Comar, 'Les Ménines', *Opus International*, no. 83, December 1981-January 1982, p. 33-39.
- 26 Peter Weibel, 'Giulio Paolini's Werk: Vom Rahmen des Bildes zu den Rahmenbedingungen der Kunst', in *Giulio Paolini Von Heute bis Gestern* [exh. cat.]. Graz, Neue Galerie im Landesmuseum Joanneum, 1998, p. 14, 16, 18.
- 27 C. Kesser, *Las Meninas...*, *op. cit.*, p. 146. P. Weibel, 'Giulio Paolini's...', *op. cit.*, p. 18.
- 28 Giulio Paolini, *Contemplator Enim*. Florence, Hopefulmonster editore, 1991, p. 35.
- 29 Richard Cork, *Michael Craig-Martin: Works 1964-2006* [exh. cat.]. Dublin, Irish Museum of Modern Art, 2006, p. 155.
- 30 Douglas Crimp, 'The Photographic Activity of Postmodernism', in his *On the Museum's Ruins*. Cambridge, Mass., MIT Press, 1993, p. 108-125.
- 31 Joel-Peter Witkin, in *Joel-Peter Witkin* [exh. cat.]. Madrid, Ministerio de Cultura, 1988, p. 25, 26.
- 32 Erik Stephan, *Joel-Peter Witkin, Compassionate Beauty* [exh. cat.]. Jena, Galerie im Stadtmuseum, Staedtische Museen, 2002, p. 5; Joel-Peter Witkin, 'Afterword', in *Joel-Peter Witkin*. Pasadena, Twelvetees Press, 1985, n. p. Thomas Mann is quoted in Robert Storr, *Disparities and Deformations: Our Grotesque. The Fifth International SITE Santa Fe Biennial, 2004-2005* [exh. cat.]. Santa Fe (NM)/New York, Distributed Art Publishers, 2004, p. 9.
- 33 Germano Celant, *Joel-Peter Witkin*. Zurich/New York, Scalo, 1995, p. 10. Enno Kaufhold, 'Joel-Peter Witkin. Animateur mit Maske', in E. Stephan, *Joel-Peter Witkin*, *op. cit.*, p. 19.
- 34 Vik Muniz in an interview with Brigitte Ollier, 'Vik Muniz: "Je suis fasciné par l'art de rendre les choses visibles"', in Laurent Millet, *Vik Muniz: Illusion et machines à images* [exh. cat.]. Toulon, Hotel des Arts, 2005, p. 59-61; Jean Arrouye, 'Vik Muniz, photographe accompli', *ibidem*, p. 53.
- 35 Jean Arrouye, 'Vik Muniz...', *op. cit.*, p. 55. Matthew Drutt, *Vik Muniz: Model Pictures* [exh. cat.]. Houston (Texas), Menil Collection, 2002, p. 17.
- 36 Charles Wylie (intro.), *Thomas Struth: 1977-2002* [exh. cat.]. London/ New Haven, Yale University Press, 2002, p. 152; Phyllis Tuchman, 'On Thomas Struth's "Museum Photographs"', *Artnet*, 7 August 2003, p. 1. Estrella de Diego, 'In the Meantime: Struth's visit to the Prado', in *Thomas Struth: Making Time* [exh. cat.]. Madrid, Museo Nacional del Prado, 2007, p. 73.
- 37 John C. Welchman, *Art after Appropriation: Essays on Art in the 1990s*. Amsterdam, G+B Arts International, 2001, p. 2; D. Crimp, 'The Photographic...', *op. cit.*, p. 41-57.
- 38 Claude Esteban, interview with the artist, Fermín Aguayo, in Charles Etienne, *Procès pour Aguayo* [exh. cat.]. Paris, Galerie Jeanne-Bucher, 1982, n. p. See also Juan Manuel Bonet, 'Découvrir Fermín Aguayo', in José Uriel, *Fermín Aguayo*. Paris, Editions Cercle d'Art, 2004, p. 89.
- 39 C. Kesser, *Las Meninas...*, *op. cit.*, p. 189.
- 40 Louis Cane, *Les ménines, les annonces, les femmes debout, les toilettes, les accouchements, les déjeuners sur l'herbe... et le déluge* [exh. cat.]. Saint-Paul de Vence, Fondation Maeght, 1983, p. 5-7, 16.
- 41 The film is directed by Eve Sussman; Choreography by Claudia de Serpa Soares; Costumes by Karen Young; Composition by Jonathan Bepko, with the participation of the following actors: Jeff Wood, Helen Pickett, Walter Sipser, Annette Previti, Nesbitt Blaisdell, Sofie Zamchick. I thank Eve Sussman and her assistant Catherine Mahoney for showing me the video in Sussman's studio.
- 42 Cleo Cacoulidis, 'Sabine Modern. On Location with Eve Sussman and The Rufus Corporation', in *Art Papers*, 30, no. 1, January/ February, 2006, p. 23.